

**CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA
HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD**

MEETING MINUTES

City Hall
Council Chambers
East side of Monte Verde Street
between Ocean and 7th Avenues
Carmel, California

20 November 2006
Monday
3:00 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER

A regular meeting of the Historic Resources Board of the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea, California was held on the above date at the stated hour of 3:00 p.m. Chairperson Wendt called the meeting to order.

II. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Erik Dyar
Erl Lagerholm
Elinor Laiolo
Julie Wendt, Chairperson

ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Nathan Schmidt, Assistant Planner
Sean Conroy, Senior Planner
Sandy Farrell, Executive Assistant

III. TOUR OF INSPECTION

The Board adjourned to the Tour of Inspection at 3:04 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 4:01 p.m.

IV. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Members of the audience joined the Board in the pledge of allegiance.

VI. APPEARANCES

Chairperson Wendt declared the public hearing open and closed at 4:02 p.m.

VII. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Ratify the amended minutes of the 17 July 2006 regular meeting.

corrections:

Lagerholm: page 2, 1st item: correct Coss vote (remove absent vote)

Wendt: page 5, 4th item: replace “homeowner” with “Carmel Preservation Foundation” as the appellant.

2. Ratify the amended minutes for the 21 August 2006 regular meeting.

no corrections

3. Ratify the minutes for the 16 October 2006 regular meeting.

corrections:

- Wendt: page 16 of Staff Report, or page 3 of Minutes: remove Holz from vote (she was absent)
Wendt: page 15, page 2 of Minutes: on Lagerholm motion replace “deny” with “grant” the appeal
Lagerholm: asked that the vote be listed in alphabetical order.

Chairperson Wendt moved approval of 17 July Minutes, as amended, and approval of 21 August Minutes, seconded by Dyer, were unanimously approved by voice vote and general consensus of Board Members Dyer, Lagerholm and Wendt.

Chairperson Wendt moved approval of 16 October Minutes, as amended, seconded by Lagerholm, were unanimously approved by voice vote and general consensus of Board members Dyer, Lagerholm, Laiolo and Wendt.

VI. APPLICATIONS

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1. DS 05-138
John Giordano
W/s Mission bet. 1 st & Vista
Blk 7.5, Lot 17 | Consideration of a Design Study application
for the substantial alteration of an existing
historic residence located in the Single-
Family Residential (R-1) District. |
|--|---|

Sean Conroy, Senior Planner, presented the staff report.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing open at 4:12 p.m.

John Mandurrango and Carla Ramsey appeared before the Board.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing closed at 4:16 p.m.

Chairman Wendt moved to approve the application with staff’s special conditions, with the exception of special Condition #1 and to permit a composite side-yard setback exception, special conditions are as follows:

SPECIAL CONDITIONS:

1. ~~The proposed roof line of the addition should be either slightly raised or lowered to differentiate from the existing roof line.~~
2. The proposed stucco siding should be slightly differentiated from the existing siding. This could be accomplished by using a courser or textured stucco finish.
3. The south facing wall of the addition shall be offset by three (3) inches from the existing wall.
4. The proposed windows and doors should be slightly differentiated from the existing windows and doors.

5. Prior to issuance of a building permit, the final construction documents shall include a materials list and a plan with elevation keynotes that clearly identify the methodology and extent of the proposed salvage and reuse of existing building materials including all exterior walls. This “salvage and reuse plan” shall clearly indicate that materials shall be: 1) preserved, 2) repaired when preservation is not possible, and 3) replaced in-kind only when absolutely necessary. The “salvage and reuse plan” shall also identify the preservation of the exterior walls and materials as identified on the applicant’s plans.
6. Prior to the beginning of construction, the applicant shall convene a pre-construction meeting to include the project architect, contractor, the City’s Building Official, and the Project Planner to ensure compliance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

Seconded by Board Member Lagerholm and carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: DYAR, LAGERHOLM, LAIOLO, WENDT
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

VII. ADMINISTRATION

1. Consideration of an action by the Board to dismiss the following appeal applications: Page 35

1. DS 06-41
Stewart Family Trust
W/s Torres bet. 8th & 9th
Blk 99, Lot 5
2. HA 05-69
Elizabeth Stinson
W/s San Antonio bet. 12th & 13th
Blk A-5, Lot 5
3. HA 05-75
Judith Reibel
W/s San Carlos bet. 13th & St. Lucia
Blk 143, Lot part 5 & 7

Sean Conroy, Senior Planner, presented the staff report.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing open at 4:23 p.m.

Marshall Stinson (son of Elizabeth Stinson) appeared before the Board.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing closed at 4:25 p.m.

Chairman Wendt continued the Elizabeth Stinson matter and remanded it to staff.

Board Member Dyar moved to dismiss the Stewart Family Trust and the Reibel inactive appeal applications, seconded by Board Member Lagerholm and carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: DYAR, LAGERHOLM, LAIOLO, WENDT
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

V. APPEALS

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. HA 05-10
Anna Yateman
E/s Carmelo bet. 10 th & 11 th
Blk Q, Lot 16 | Consideration of an appeal of the City's determination to place an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District on the City's Inventory of Historic Resources. |
|--|--|

Nathan Schmidt, Assistant Planner, presented the staff report.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing open at 4:30 p.m.

Anna Yateman appeared before the Board.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing closed at 4:34 p.m.

Chairman Wendt moved to continue the appeal, to have a DPR evaluator strengthen the evaluation and return the evaluation to the Board, was seconded by Dyar.

Lagerholm recommended that the evaluation have a peer review.

Chairman Wendt made a substitute motion to continue the appeal, to have peer review of the evaluation and return the evaluation to the Board, was seconded by Lagerholm and carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: DYAR, LAGERHOLM, WENDT
NOES: LAIOLO
ABSENT: NONE

- | | |
|--|--|
| 2. HA 05-9
Virginia Hayes
E/s San Antonio bet. Ocean & 4 th
Blk HH, Lot 22 | Consideration of an appeal of the City's determination to place an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District on the City's Inventory of Historic Resources. |
|--|--|

Sean Conroy, Senior Planner, presented the staff report.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing open at 4:51 p.m.

Jim Heisinger appeared before the Board.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing closed at 4:56 p.m.

Board Member Dyar moved to deny the appeal; to amend the DPR by removing Thomas Church the designer of the garden, seconded by Lagerholm, and carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: DYAR, LAGERHOLM, WENDT
NOES: LAIOLO
ABSENT: NONE

- | | |
|--|--|
| 3. HA 05-32
Darwin Barrett
E/s Monte Verde bet. 8 th & 9 th
Blk 94, Lot 6 | Consideration of an appeal of the City's determination to place an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District on the City's Inventory of Historic Resources. |
|--|--|

Nathan Schmit, Assistant Planner presented his staff report.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing open at 5:08 p.m.

Darwin Barrett appeared before the Board.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing closed at 5:09 p.m.

Dyar asked staff to provide more information on Arnott in the DPR; and to add comparables with Carmel Stone.

Board Member Lagerholm moved to grant the appeal and remove the house from Historic Resources, seconded by Laiolo, failed by the following roll call vote:

AYES: LAGERHOLM, LAIOLO
NOES: DYAR, WENDT
ABSENT: NONE

Board Member Dyar moved to continue the matter to December's meeting, to bring back more information, was seconded by Lagerholm, and carried by the following roll call vote:

Board Member Dyar moved to continue the matter to December's meeting, to bring back more information, was seconded by Lagerholm, and carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: DYAR, LAGERHOLM, LAIOLO, WENDT
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

- | | |
|--|---|
| 4. HA 05-72
Carol Benton Richmond
E/s Mission bet. 7 th & 8 th
Blk 89, Lot 18 | Consideration of an appeal of the City's determination to place an existing building located in the Residential and Limited Commercial (RC) District on the City's Inventory of Historic Resources. |
|--|---|

This item was continued per applicants request.

- | | |
|--|--|
| 5. HA 05-95
Margaret Kim
W/s San Antonio bet. Ocean & 4 th
Blk SS, Lot 3 | Consideration of an appeal of the City's determination to place an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District on the City's Inventory of Historic Resources. |
| 6. HA 05-96
Gwendolyn Metz
W/s San Antonio bet. Ocean & 4 th
Blk SS, Lot 5 | Consideration of an appeal of the City's determination to place an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District on the City's Inventory of Historic Resources. |
| 7. HA 05-97
David Liskin
W/s San Antonio bet. Ocean & 4 th
Blk SS, Lot 5 | Consideration of an appeal of the City's determination to place an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District on the City's Inventory of Historic Resources. |

Items 5, 6 and 7 were all reviewed together as part of the Sand and Sea Development.

Sean Conroy, Senior Planner, presented the staff report.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing open at 5:33 p.m.

Miriam Schakat from Lombardo & Gilles spoke for appellants Kim and Metz, and Mary Liskin owner of Lot 5, appeared before the Board.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing closed at 5:58 p.m.

Board Member Lagerholm moved to grant appeals to HA 05-95, HA 05-96 and HA 05-97, was seconded by Dyar, carried by the following roll call vote:

AYES: DYAR, LAGERHOLM, LAIOLO
NOES: WENDT
ABSENT: NONE

- | | |
|--|--|
| 8. HA 05-70
Marcia Green
NW Cor. Guadalupe & 3 rd
Blk 23, Lot 19 | Consideration of an appeal of the City's determination to place an existing residence located in the Single Family Residential (R-1) District on the City's Inventory of Historic Resources. |
|--|--|

Sean Conroy, Senior Planner, presented the staff report.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing open at 6:09 p.m.

Marcia Green, appellant, appeared before the Board.

Chairman Wendt declared the public hearing closed at 6:13 p.m.

Board Member Dyar moved to deny the appeal, was seconded by Wendt, failed by the following roll call vote:

AYES: DYAR, WENDT
NOES: LAGERHOLM, LAIOLO
ABSENT: NONE

No other action taken.

VI. ADJOURNMENT

Board Member Lagerholm mentioned that he will miss the January meeting.

There being no further business, the Chairperson declared the meeting adjourned at 6:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Sandy Farrell, Executive Assistant

Approved.

Julie Wendt, Chairperson