

appeal, the DPR should be revised to accurately reflect the description of the building.

Criterion #3: California Register Criterion #3 states that a structure must “embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region, or method of construction, or represents the work of a master or posses high artistic values.” The original building permit does not identify Rowan Maiden as the architect. However, an article in House Beautiful magazine describes the house and identifies Maiden as the architect. While an updated Context Statement may shed more light on the importance of Rowan Maiden and the Bay Area Tradition of architecture in the City, a fair argument has been made in the DPR form that Maiden qualifies as an important designer and that the structure is a good example of the Bay Area style. A fair argument can also be made that the residence possesses high artistic values based on its unique floor plan and design.

In addition, no supporting evidence has been provided indicating that Rowan Maiden and/or the architectural design are not historically significant.

Thomas D. Church: The DPR makes reference to the gardens designed by Thomas D. Church. The appellant indicates that she has been unable to verify that Thomas Church designed the gardens. Staff has also been unable to verify any connection with Church. If the Council denies the appeal, staff recommends that the references to Mr. Church be removed.

HRB’s Review: In summary, the HRB’s decision to deny the appeal was based on the following points:

- The DPR presents a fair argument that Rowan Maiden is historically significant.
- The residence is the only identified structure designed by Maiden in the City.
- While the conversion of the carport to a garage was significant, it did not affect the primary character defining features of the residence.
- The Municipal Code requires “substantial evidence” in order to remove a property from the Inventory. No substantial evidence has been provided suggesting the property is not historic.

Staff concurs with the Board.

RECOMMENDATION

~~Deny the appeal, adopt the attached Findings, and direct staff to remove all references to Thomas Church in the DRP 523 Form and make other minor edits as needed.~~ Grant the appeal.

Post Office Box 6204
Carmel-by-the-Sea
California, 93921

Mr Sean Conroy
City of Carmel-by-the-Sea
Post Office Drawer G
Carmel, Ca. 93921

Re; Appeal to the City Council of Historic Designation
HA 65-9

Dear Sean;

I have enclosed pictures of my house before and after the addition of 1994. The roof is the only part that remains the same in both pictures. The carport was open on all three sides with two (4x4) posts on the side facing the street.

Because the addition has substantially changed the appearance of the house, I ask the City Council of Carmel-by-the-Sea to remove my house from the Historic Designation.

There were were also considerable errors in the D.P.R. form which I referred to in my letter (Not 31, 2006) to Sean and the Planning Commission. Also the fireplace is in the N. E. corner rather than the S. E.

Concerning the garden; On July 27, 2005, I had an appointment at the Monterey Museum of Art. Absolutely no mention was made of a Thomas Church Garden in the references supplied by Richard Janick. Also the Park Branch Library had no information of a design by Thomas Church for Mrs Chapman, the previous owner.

This information, or lack thereof, together with the letter regarding the Thomas Church Archives at U.C. Berkeley would indicate to me that Thomas Church was NOT involved in the design or installation of the garden.

Thank you for your time and consideration of these matters.

Sincerely,

Virginia Hayes
Virginia Hayes

Lot 22 Block HH
San Antonio, 3 SE of 4th
Carmel-by-the-Sea
California, 93921

2 pictures, one of the original carport and one of the 1994 addition have been included. I have the plans for the 1994 addition. Please call me at 625-6712 if you would like to see them.

1994 Addition - Lot 2 - Block H-H

South
West →



West →



North →



Original House - Lot 22 - B.O. 5414

