

Post Office Box 6204
Carmel-by-the-Sea, California 93921

October 31, 2006

Mr. Sean Conroy
City of Carmel-by-the-Sea
Post Office Drawer G
Carmel, CA 93921

Re: Historical Appeal HA 05-9

Dear Sean:

In your letter to me dated October 13, 2006, you indicated that you were prepared to recommend that the appeal I filed over the Historic designation of my home be dismissed. I oppose your recommendation and request a full hearing on my appeal.

My home is contemporary with single wall construction and a flat roof. It originally had a carport.

It was NOT designed by Frank Lloyd Wright as mentioned in a permit application in Sept. 1994. It was designed by Rowen Maiden who was indeed a student of Mr. Wright. I believe that through the years there were many, many apprentices of Frank Lloyd Wright with these same people designing thousands of houses. Mr. Wright was certainly important and famous. However, I definitely do not believe Mr. Maiden was important to the history of Carmel-by-the-Sea.

In addition, the most visible aspect of my house as viewed from the street dramatically changed when I converted the carport to garage in 1994. One wall of the carport was white stucco. The garage now has three additional walls of vertical overlap redwood siding and also a garage door. Pretty much all you can see of my house from the street was NOT designed by Rowen Maiden.

I expressed my view against mandatory designation at a meeting of the planning commission several years ago. I also expressed my view in a letter of July 13, 2005. I repeat my stand against this historical designation.

Page 2.

There are substantial errors in the DPR form reported by Richard N. Janick.

He states there is an oriental style garden designed by Thomas Church. When I checked at the Monterey Museum, which was his reference, I found six photographs of my garden but absolutely no mention of Thomas Church. Box 91 which he refers to as Morley Baer (photographer) Archive does not exist at the museum. The Archives at U.C. Berkeley of the Thomas Church papers and records have nothing to indicate a design for Dorothy Green Chapman. See attachment 1 to my letter.

When I bought the house from Mrs. Chapman's estate, the garden had many overgrown vines and was sadly neglected. It now is essentially a different garden of almost sixty years ago.

There were other errors in Mr. Janick's report. He indicated there was a glass windscreen shielding the garden from the neighbors. No such glass screen has existed since my purchase of the house in 1992.

He states that interior sliding screens suggest Japanese influence. There were no such screens when I purchased the house.

The clerestory windows do not slide open as described by Richard Janick.

The siding has been applied in an overlapping manner rather than flush.

To my knowledge, Mr. Janick was never in my home or garden; nor did he ever contact me.

Mrs. Dorothy Green Chapman, the original owner of the houses, has already been remembered with a room at Sunset Center named in her honor.

Thank you for your attention in this matter. I repeat my appeal to remove my house from the so-called historic list.

Please take steps to assure that my home is removed from the historical designation as soon as possible.

Sincerely,

Virginia Wilder Hayes
Virginia Wilder Hayes

Phone 831-625-6712

462 Merritt Avenue
Oakland, CA 94610

June 1, 2006

Mrs. Virginia Hayes
P. O. Box 6204
Carmel by the Sea, CA 93921

Dear Virginia,

Following our discussion about whether or not Thomas Church was involved in the design of your garden on San Antonio Avenue in Carmel, I talked with Waverly Lowell, the College of Environmental Design Archivist at UC Berkeley, where the Thomas Church office papers are now stored. She has checked archive's inventory and the project lists which were compiled by Church's office. The office records include a list of Church's gardens in the Carmel area going back as far as 1947. Waverly found no mention of a garden for Dorothy Greene Chapman in either the archive's inventory or in the Church office records.

I hope I will be able to take you up on your offer of tea the next time I am in Carmel.

Sincerely yours,

Margaret J. Arnall